

**Combinatorial Optimization** (Fall 2016)

**Assignment 7**

Deadline: November 18 10:00, into the right box in front of MA C1 563.

Exercises marked with a  $\star$  can be handed in for bonus points.

**Problem 1**

Given a matroid  $M = (E, \mathcal{I})$  and its corresponding matroid polytope  $P_M$ , show that its associated system of inequalities  $\{x(S) \leq \text{rk}(S) \forall S \subset E, x \geq 0\}$  is Totally Dual Integral.

**Solution:**

We have to show that for any  $c \in \mathbb{Z}^m$ , the dual of the LP  $\max\{cx : x(S) \leq \text{rk}(S) \forall S \subset E, x \geq 0\}$  has an optimal integral solution. But this has been shown in the lecture: setting  $y_e = c_i - c_{i+1}$  for any  $e$  picked by the greedy algorithm,  $y_e = 0$  for any other, gives an optimal dual solution that is trivially integral.

**Problem 2**

Let  $G$  be a disconnected graph with connected components  $G_1, G_2$ , and let  $P$  be the matching polytope of  $G$ , and  $P_i$  the matching polytope of  $G_i$ ,  $i = 1, 2$ . Show that  $P = P_1 \times P_2$  (where, given polytopes  $A \subset \mathbb{R}^n, B \subset \mathbb{R}^m$ , we define their cartesian product  $A \times B = \{(x, y) \in \mathbb{R}^{n+m} : x \in A, y \in B\}$ ).

**Solution:**

Let us denote by  $E_i$  the set of edges of  $G_i$ ,  $i = 1, 2$ . Notice that  $M \subset E$  a matching in  $G$  if and only if  $M = M_1 \cup M_2$ , where  $M_i \subseteq E_i$  is a matching in  $G_i$  for  $i = 1, 2$ . This immediately implies that  $P$  and  $P_1 \times P_2$  have the same vertices, hence they are the same polytope.

**Problem 3**

Let  $\mathcal{C}$  be the cone generated by linearly independent vectors  $a_1, \dots, a_n \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , i.e.

$$\mathcal{C} = \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^n \lambda_i a_i : \lambda_i \geq 0 \forall i = 1, \dots, n \right\}.$$

Show that for any  $i = 1, \dots, n$  there is a point  $c \in \mathcal{C} \cap \mathbb{Z}^n$  such that  $c + e_i \in \mathcal{C}$ .

**Solution:**

We show that there is a point  $c \in \mathcal{C} \cap \mathbb{Z}^n$  in the cone such that a ball of radius 1 and center  $c$  is entirely contained in  $\mathcal{C}$ . To see this, we first show that  $\mathcal{C}$  contains arbitrary large balls. Consider the polytope  $Q = \text{conv}\{\pm a_i\}$ , which has dimension  $n$  since the  $a_i$ 's are linearly independent. This means that there exist a ball of radius  $r > 0$  contained in  $Q$ . Clearly, the translate  $Q + \sum_i a_i$  is contained in  $\mathcal{C}$ , and it still contains such ball. By multiplying by an arbitrary large factor  $k$ , we have that  $k(Q + \sum_i a_i)$  is contained in  $\mathcal{C}$  and contains an arbitrary large ball  $\mathcal{B}$ . Now, it is easy to see that any ball of radius at least  $\sqrt{n}/2$  contains an integer point: for instance, it contains a cube with side length 1, which can be written as  $v + x : 0 \leq x \leq 1$  for some translation vector  $v$ . Then choosing  $x = \lfloor v \rfloor - v$  gives us the desired point. By requiring that  $\mathcal{B}$  has radius at least  $\sqrt{n}/2 + 1$ ,

we are then sure that the integer point is also surrounded by a ball of radius 1 contained in  $\mathcal{B}$ , hence in  $\mathcal{C}$ , and we are done.

**Problem 4** (★)

Two vertices  $x^1, x^2$  of a polyhedron  $P = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n : Ax \leq b\}$  are said to be *adjacent* if there is a subsystem  $A'x \leq b'$  of  $Ax \leq b$  such that  $A' \in \mathbb{R}^{(n-1) \times n}$ , the rows of  $A'$  are linearly independent, and  $x^1, x^2$  satisfy  $A'x \leq b'$  with equality.

Let  $M = (E, \mathcal{I})$  be a matroid and  $P_M$  the corresponding matroid polytope. Given  $I_1, I_2 \in \mathcal{I}$  with  $I_1 \neq I_2$ , show that  $\chi^{I_1}$  and  $\chi^{I_2}$  are adjacent vertices of  $P_M$  if and only if one of the following conditions hold:

- (i)  $I_1 \subseteq I_2$  and  $|I_1| + 1 = |I_2|$
- (ii)  $I_2 \subseteq I_1$  and  $|I_2| + 1 = |I_1|$
- (iii)  $|I_1 \setminus I_2| = |I_2 \setminus I_1| = 1$  and  $I_1 \cup I_2 \notin \mathcal{I}$

**Solution:**

Let  $A, b$  be such that  $P_M = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^E : Ax \leq b\}$ , and let  $|E| = n$ .

( $\Leftarrow$ ) Suppose  $I_1$  and  $I_2$  satisfy (i). Then  $I_1$  and  $I_2$  satisfy:

$$x(e) = rk(e) \quad \forall e \in I_1 \tag{1}$$

$$x(e) = 0 \quad \forall e \notin I_2, \tag{2}$$

which corresponds to a submatrix of  $A$  with  $n - 1$  linearly independent rows. The case (ii) is analogous. For the case (iii), we need a slightly different system:

$$x(e) = rk(e) \quad \forall e \in I_1 \cap I_2 \tag{3}$$

$$x(e) = 0 \quad \forall e \notin I_1 \cup I_2 \tag{4}$$

$$x(I_1 \cup I_2) = rk(I_1 \cup I_2). \tag{5}$$

It is immediate to see that rows of the corresponding submatrix of  $A$  are linearly independent.

( $\Rightarrow$ ) First consider the case where  $I_1$  is not a base of  $I_1 \cup I_2$ . Then by the third axiom there exists some  $j \in I_2 \setminus I_1$  such that  $I_1 \cup j \in \mathcal{I}$ . Hence

$$\frac{1}{2} (\chi^{I_1} + \chi^{I_2}) = \frac{1}{2} (\chi^{I_1 \cup j} + \chi^{I_2 \setminus j}). \tag{6}$$

We now show that this implies that  $I_1 \cup j = I_2$  and  $I_2 \setminus j = I_1$ , meaning that we are in case (i). Indeed, since  $\chi^{I_1}$  and  $\chi^{I_2}$  are adjacent, there is a supporting hyperplane that intersects  $P_M$  exactly in the segment between  $\chi^{I_1}, \chi^{I_2}$ . Consider any point in the segment (in particular the midpoint): since  $P_M$  is a polytope, it is a convex combination of vertices of  $P_M$ , but it can only be expressed as combination of  $\chi^{I_1}, \chi^{I_2}$  (all other vertices are on the same side of the supporting hyperplane). Since we expressed this midpoint as the midpoint of another segment between  $\chi^{I_1 \cup j}$  and  $\chi^{I_2 \setminus j}$  it must be that these are actually the same vertices as  $\chi^{I_1}$  and  $\chi^{I_2}$ , and we are done.

The case where  $I_2$  is not a base of  $I_1 \cup I_2$  is similar. Hence it remains to consider the case where both  $I_1$  and  $I_2$  are bases of  $I_1 \cup I_2$  (hence  $I_1 \cup I_2 \notin \mathcal{I}$ ). Using the strong basis exchange property, there are  $i \in I_1 \setminus I_2, j \in I_2 \setminus I_1$  such that  $I_1 \setminus i \cup j$  and  $I_2 \setminus j \cup i$  are both bases of  $I_1 \cup I_2$ . But then

$$\frac{1}{2} (\chi^{I_1} + \chi^{I_2}) = \frac{1}{2} (\chi^{I_1 \setminus i \cup j} + \chi^{I_2 \setminus j \cup i}) \tag{7}$$

and using the same argument as before we have that  $I_1 \setminus i \cup j = I_2$  and  $I_2 \setminus j \cup i = I_1$ , meaning that  $I_1$  and  $I_2$  satisfy (iii).